Metaphors of Knowing, Doing and Being: Capturing Experience in Teaching and Teacher Education

Cheryl J. Craig, Ph.D.
Texas A&M University
Introduction

Bateson's idea of human beings thinking with metaphors and learning through stories provided the framework for five storied metaphors capturing knowing, doing and being.

Cross-case analysis reveals the importance of narrative exemplars, along with the significance of metaphors serving as proxies for teachers' experiences.

Value of metaphors in surfacing teachers' embedded, embodied knowledge is affirmed along with the deftness of narrative inquiry research method.
Experience

Past Experience

Current Experience

Future Experience

Experience, Education and Life

John Dewey (1938)
Story

Current experience

Past experience

Future experience

STORY
“portal to experience”

Meaning and Interpretation
Metaphor

Human beings use metaphors to story and make sense of life

Metaphors are valuable cognitive devices (Lakoff & Johnson, 1980) and represent the highest form of human intelligence (Bruner, 1996)

Metaphors are cross disciplinary and cross-cultural in scope and understanding
Types of Metaphors

Novel metaphors
- Imaginative quality and possess generative power (Schon, 1993)
- Compact, able to express the inexpressible... limitless in interpretation (Ortony, 1975)

Emergent metaphors
- Intuitively held (Breault, 2006)
- Naturally appear in the midst of explaining one's practice to oneself or someone else (Craig, 2005)
Research Method

Narrative Inquiry: unpacks human experience through the use of story

Broadening—setting the backdrop for their narratives

Burrowing—explicating fine-grained details in their narratives

Storying and Restorying—shows how change occurs over time

Source: https://www.flickr.com/photos/1055555678/89991051234/
Serial Interpretation

Serial interpretation

“encompassing idea[s]”

to “talk across”

“look across” stories
Research Backdrop

T.P. Yaeger Middle School:
- 1500 students
- Historical schools in largest district
- IB campus serves richest and poorest children in nation
- Metaphors 1-3

Destiny High School:
- Region's most affluent district
- Experimental campus
- 120 hand-picked secondary youth
- 6% diversity
- Predominately white suburban district
- Metaphor 5

General research context:
- 4th largest city in the U.S.
- Mid-southern part of the nation
- Includes six school districts within heavily populated, urban core

Composite group of teachers:
- Employed by three geographically close districts
- Schools served mostly African American and Latino economically disadvantaged groups
- Metaphor 4

Source: Joe Mabel [GFDL (http://www.gnu.org/copyleft/fdl.html) or CC-BY-SA-3.0 (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/3.0/)], via Wikimedia Commons
Five Metaphors

1. Anna’s Coming to Know in the Eye of the Storm metaphor

2. Laura’s Butterfly under to a Pin metaphor

3. Helen’s Teaching as a Strand of Pearls metaphor

4. Teacher Research Group as a Braided River Flowing In and Out of Community metaphor

5. Lydia’s Reforming School as a Rainbow Fish metaphor

Source: https://www.flickr.com/photos/gsfc/21768979714
https://i.pinimg.com/originals/eb/ae/6bedaeafe390dca8d0558539fb2f7510.jpg
Metaphor 1: “Coming to Know in the Eye of the Storm”

Volunteer research participant and novice teacher, Anna Dean, describes her experience as a newcomer who became unavoidably embroiled in struggles already underway on her campus. Anna left the teaching profession after six years of wrestling with school reform on her campus and became a teacher attrition statistic.

All of the other teachers met as a group to plan their literacy lessons. Anna Dean did not have the same planning period as the rest. Yet, she was held to the same standard as other more experienced teachers.
Metaphor 2: “Butterfly under a Pin”

Experienced teacher Laura Curtis’s image of teacher-as-curriculum maker was intentionally changed to teacher-as-implementer through external and forced intervention.

“I became unhappy when I realized it [the reform] was being forced on us and I began to feel like a butterfly under a pin.”

“It was making me feel not in charge of my own teaching when throughout my career I have felt in charge.”

Source: https://thebuggeek.com/tag/monarch-butterfly/#jp-carousel-4609
Metaphor 3: “Teaching as a Strand of Pearls”

“It’s all about the pearls. You make a pearl necklace. You add a few pearls each year… The strand of pearls keeps growing… Teaching is a strand of pearls…”

“Nobody wants to talk about keys on a chain… They want to talk about something valuable… Pearls are valuable…”

Helen became a “good teacher” because she was focused on pedagogical growth, using the “classroom…to reflect upon education as a whole…, as a laboratory…to translate reflections into actions and thus test reflections, actions, and outcomes…” (Schwab, 1959/1978)
Metaphor 4: “Braided River Flowing In and Out of Community”

• The novel metaphor concept of a braided river employs the to understand a teacher research group’s shared twenty year history. Members of the group were continually shaped and reshaped by the group’s interactions and the stories given back to them as a result of their collaboration.

• They used four words to describe their collaborative work:
  – interconnected
  – inter-related
  – interwoven
  – Intertwined

• “It reminds me of the braided rivers that I saw in Alaska…multiple streams diverging and converging repeatedly over the landscape.”
Metaphor 5: “School as a Rainbow Fish”

- Lydia Thomas came to Destiny High School as a beginning principal. When she arrived, she said she had been assigned “a rainbow fish” school to lead. Lydia “coaxed” the rainbow fish metaphor into somatic and allegorical relationship with Destiny High School faculty.

- Lydia asked faculty to describe Destiny’s beautiful design features (scales). They also described the problems (scales) that were making Destiny a very unhappy workplace environment.

- Lydia provided the Destiny faculty with the opportunity to elucidate their school’s story in their own terms.
Meta-Level Analysis

Metaphors serving as containers for meaning

Novel metaphors as proxies for experience

Strong moral dimensions of teachers’ knowing (Estola, 2003)

No one truth, but metaphors are truthlike (Bruner, 1986)

http://nyphotographic.com/
https://www.flickr.com/photos/dfataustralianaid/10699540104
By darwin Bell from San Francisco, USA (Truth! Uploaded by Fæ) [CC BY 2.0 (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/2.0)], via Wikimedia Commons
Importance and Relevance

This research confirms “metaphor is... not our way of ornamenting reality but our most important way of making it” (Booth, 1983, p. 619).

Affords razor-sharp glimpses not often shared

Insights provide new ways of imagining and re-imagining lives of participants

Constitute promising catalysts of change in teaching and teacher education
Interim Conclusion

Emergent, novel metaphors bridge experience and meaning (Pope & Gilbert, 1983)

Work’s metaphors are generative, not reductive, in their outlook (Pineau, 1994)

When embraced, metaphors have the ability to “heal and transform” (Greene, 1993)

Metaphors constitute promising catalysts of change

Source: https://www.flickr.com/photos/wansinkphotography/6364758657
http://maxpixel.freegreatpicture.com/Butterfly-Transform-Insect-Chrysalis-Change-Cocoon-655526
By Huhnra (Own work) [CC BY-SA 4.0 (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0)], via Wikimedia Commons
Metaphors of Reciprocal Learning???
Types of Metaphors

Stock metaphors-
metaphors culled from an inventory of commonly available comparisons

Ascribed metaphors-
metaphors chosen by someone else or by you from the available stockpile
What novel, emergent metaphors will you encounter at this Reciprocal Learning Conference?

**Novel metaphors**
- Imaginative quality and possess generative power (Schön, 1993)
- Compact, able to express the inexpressible... limitless in interpretation (Ortony, 1975)

**Emergent metaphors**
- Intuitively held (Breault, 1986)
- Naturally appear in the midst of explaining one's practice to oneself or someone else (Craig, 2005)
How will novel metaphors you make up or encounter convey the ideas that:

• “Human beings are immersed in webs of reciprocity...” (Buber, 1970)
• “Each learns from the other, each teaches the other and all are changed....” (Bateson, 1994)
• “Relationships...are always at least two-way, back-and-forth” (LeGuin, 2016)
• “Relation is reciprocity” (Buber, 1970)
• Enables one to “see from the other side” (Buber, 1970)
Which novel metaphors will convey the idea that:

“We humans are an infinite network of connections, simple or complicated, direct or hidden, strong or delicate, temporary or long-lasting. A web of connections, infinite but locally fragile, with and among everything…” (LeGuin, 2016)
How will you capture “relational engagement”: “the shared moment in which people [find] a way to look at something together?” (Bergum & Dossetor, 2005)
References


Source slide 1:

https://i.pinimg.com/originals/6b/ed/ae/6bedaeafe390dca8d0558539fb2f7510.jpg

https://www.flickr.com/photos/nasahqphoto/


http://pinxpets.com/rainbow-fish-seen-it-while-snorkeling-in-the-red-sea-was-stunningly-beautiful/

https://www.flickr.com/photos/zenonas/33446420742/in/photolist-SXxDCA-gRBimc-89mWJd-4qFdu7-7VqqXr-3fa8AQ-7VtEgA-8KFC28-3faaFf-3f5LnH-68eNap-cQRAYC-ryZ3s4-3f5LCc-8x8Qoq-bMHHon-9Fwv1S-8ELbB1-i8F68W-3N6fUh-83MQPr-3f5JXv-JiNFhD-7jFXyg-dTWwvz-e5kH9q-7VtEAb-3f5tHT-Tbb3iw-3faaiL-orv9tm-7uNoHd-4evgTR-peckFh-p5ZKhx-qiwPDs-qsdLRB-qbQnRS-Fg5Lau-f3rh3D-dK251V-52wagd-aeW6cK-pk3p7y-VveURm-e44YoA-pSgdks-baEQeD-8vQTF8-quKptD